BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03323 7645

Cases and Materials: Advanced Constitutional Law

THE STRUCTURE OF CHARTER RIGHTS

Professor L. Weinrib

VOLUME II
SPRING TERM 92

University of Toronto

Faculty of Law

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
FEB 26 1992
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Cases and Materials: Advanced Constitutional Law

THE STRUCTURE OF CHARTER RIGHTS

Professor L. Weinrib

VOLUME II
SPRING TERM 92

University of Toronto

Faculty of Law

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/advancedconstitu02wein

C. Structure #3: Conditioned Rights, Limits & Override

i) Evolution of the Charter text

W.S. Tarnopolsky, The Canadian Bill of Rights (1975) ch. 1 1

Documents from A. F. Bayefsky, Canada's Constitution Act 1982 & Amendments: A Documentary History (1989):

Victoria Charter, June 24-26, 1971 (214-215)(extract) 15

Charter draft, July 8-11, 1980 (599-604) Chart of July 4th, Aug. 22nd and Aug. 28th, 1980 drafts (682-685) . . 17

Report by Sub-Committee of Officials on a Charter of Right, July 24, 1980 (661-664) 27

Charter of Rights and Freedoms, Commentary on Revised Discussion Draft, Federal, Sept. 3, 1980 (Bayefsky at 708-709) 31

Proposed Resolution & Possible Amendments, Special Joint Committee on the Constitution, 1980-81 (766-772) 33

Amendments to the Proposed Resolution, House of Commons and Senate Debates, February-May, 1981 (814) . 40

Charter text as amended by Special Joint Committee (788-792) 41

Further Amendments in House of Commons and Senate Debates, February-May, 1981 (816-817) 46

Proposed Amendments, House of Commons, April 24, 1981 (818) 47

Consolidation of Proposed Constitutional Resolution Tabled by Minister of Justice in House of Commons on February 13, 1981 (820-825) 48

Federal-Provincial First Ministers' Conference, Nov. 2-5, 1981, Agreement and Fact Sheet (904-5) . . 54

C. Structure #3: Conditioned Rights, Limits & Override

i) Evolution of the Charter text

W.S. Tarnopolsky, The Canadian Bill of Rights (1975) ch. 1 1

Documents from A. F. Bayefsky, Canada's Constitution Act 1982 & Amendments: A Documentary History (1989):

Victoria Charter, June 24-26, 1971 (214-215)(extract) 15

Charter draft, July 8-11, 1980 (599-604) Chart of July 4th, Aug. 22nd and Aug. 28th, 1980 drafts (682-685) . . 17

Report by Sub-Committee of Officials on a Charter of Right, July 24, 1980 (661-664) 27

Charter of Rights and Freedoms, Commentary on Revised Discussion Draft, Federal, Sept. 3, 1980 (Bayefsky at 708-709) 31

Proposed Resolution & Possible Amendments, Special Joint Committee on the Constitution, 1980-81 (766-772) 33

Amendments to the Proposed Resolution, House of Commons and Senate Debates, February-May, 1981 (814) . 40

Charter text as amended by Special Joint Committee (788-792) 41

Further Amendments in House of Commons and Senate Debates, February-May, 1981 (816-817) 46

Proposed Amendments, House of Commons, April 24, 1981 (818) 47

Consolidation of Proposed Constitutional Resolution Tabled by Minister of Justice in House of Commons on February 13, 1981 (820-825) 48

Federal-Provincial First Ministers' Conference, Nov. 2-5, 1981, Agreement and Fact Sheet (904-5) . . 54

Page #

Proposed Resolution, House of Commons and Senate Debates, Nov-Dec, 1981, s. 28 and s. 33 (921) 56

Amendments to the Proposed Resolution, Nov. 23 to Dec 8, 1981 (922, 923, 924) 57

ii) **Rights-Oriented Model in the Supreme Court of Canada Majority Jurisprudence**

purposive rights (extracts)

Hunter v. Southam (1984), 11 D.L.R. (4th) 641 (S.C.C.), per Dickson J. 58

R. v. Big M Drug Mart (1985) 18 D.L.R. 4th 321 (S.C.C.) 61

R. v. Therens (1985) 18 D.L.R. 4th 655 (S.C.C.), per Le Dain J. at 675-5 70

Dubois v. The Queen (1985) 23 D.L.R. (4th) 503, Lamer J. 71

Ref. re s. 94(2) of the Motor Vehicle Act (B.C.), [1985] 2 S.C.R. 486, Lamer J. 72

Ford v. Quebec (A.G.) (1988), 54 D.L.R. (4th) 577 at 604-609, per the Court 75

justified limits (extracts)

A.G. Quebec v. Quebec Protestant School Boards, [1984] 2 S.C.R. 66 at 85ff, per the Court . . 79

Singh v. Minister of Employment and Immigration, [1985] 1 S.C.R. 177 at 218, per Wilson J. . . 80

R.v. Big M Drug Mart Ltd., [1985] 1 S.C.R. 295 at 352, per Dickson J. 81

Ref. re s. 94(2) of the Motor Vehicle Act, supra . 82

R. v. Oakes, [1986] 1 S.C.R. 103 at 135-142, Dickson C.J.C. 83

R. v. Morgentaler (1988), 44 D.L.R. (4th) 385 per Dickson C.J.C., Beetz J. and Wilson J. . . 87

Ford v. Quebec (A.G.) (1988), 54 D.L.R. (4th) 577
at 619-26, per the Court 93

full discussion of rights and limits

R. v. Keegstra (1990), 61 C.C.C. (3d) 1,
per Dickson C.J.C. (majority only) 98

R. v. Swain (1991) 63 C.C.C. (3d) 481
Dickson C.J.C. and Wilson J.(edited) 114

iii) **Interest Balancing Model in the Supreme Court of Canada Majority Jurisprudence**

extracts

Mills. v. The Queen (1986), 26 C.C.C. (3rd) 481
per McIntyre J. 148

Irwin Toy Ltd. v. A.G.Quebec (1989), 58 D.L.R.
(4th) 577 149

United States of America v. Cotroni (1989), 48
C.C.C. (3d) 193 at 209-227 per La Forest J. . 158

R. v. Askov (1990), 74 D.L.R. (4th) 355 168

McKinney v. University of Guelph (1990), 76 D.L.R.
(4th) 545 170

full discussion of rights and limits

Ref. re Electoral Boundaries Commission Act,
(1991), 81 D.L.R. 16 187

R. v. Chaulk (1990), 62 C.C.C. (3d) 193 201

iv) **Override**

Alliance des Professeurs de Montreal v. A.G.
Quebec (1985), 21 D.L.R. (4th) 354
(Quebec C.A.) 240

Ford v. Quebec (A.G.) (1988) 54 D.L.R. (4th) 577
at 592-601 (S.C.C.) 247

L.E.Weinrib, "Learning to Live with the Override",
(1990) 35 McGill Law Journal 541 253

John D. Whyte, "On Not Standing for Notwithstanding", (1990) 28 Alta Law Rev. 347 269

Peter H. Russell, "Standing Up for Notwithstanding" (1990) 29 Alta Law Rev 293 275

III. **Living Constitution**

Ref. Re the word "Persons" in section 24 of the B.N.A. Act, 1867, [1928] S.C.R. 276 284

Edwards v. A.G. Canada, [1930] A.C. 124 306

F.L. Morton and Rainer Knopff, "Permanence and Change in a Written Constitution: The 'Living Tree' Doctrine and the Charter of Rights" (1990) Supreme Court Law Rev. 533 322

Thurgood Marshall, "The Constitution's Bicentennial: Commemorating the Wrong Document?", (1987) 40 Vanderbilt Law Rev. 1337 at 1342 330

William J. Brennan, "Construing the Constitution", (1985) 19 U.C. Davis Law Review 2 341

IV. **Proposals for Change**

i) **Distinct Society Clause**

Meech Lake Accord, 1987: sections 1 and 16. 349

Patrick J. Monahan, "Was Meech Lake a True Compromise", from Meech Lake: The Inside Story (1991) 241 ff. 350

Deborah Coyne, "Constitutional Reform and the Charter of Rights and Freedoms", (1991) 55 Sask. Law Rev. 203, plus Appendices: 353

Eminent Jurist Opinion, June 9th, 1990 359

News Release and letter, June 14th, 1990 . . . 360

Letter, Inuit Tapirisat to Prof. P. W. Hogg, June 11, 1990 361

Letter, Prof. P.W. Hogg to Inuit Tapirisat, June 13, 1990 362

OpEd, "Should Quebec "distinctness" be entrenched? 363

Charles Taylor, "Shared and Divergent Values", from Options for a New Canada (1991) 364

Constitutional Proposals, Sept. 1991 376

Katherine Swinton, "The distinct society and the Charter" (1991) 1 The Network 6 378

Sheldon Godfrey, Submission to the Special Joint Committee of the Senate and House of Commons on A Renewed Canada 379

Department of Justice of Canada, "The Legal Effect of the Distinct Society Clause", dated Oct. 24, 1991 384

OpEd, "What Does it all mean for the Charter?" . . 390

Newspaper clippings 392

Speech Notes, Gil Remillard, Minister of Justice and of Canadian Intergovernmental Affairs of Quebec, Jan. 15, 1992 407

Newspaper clippings 411

ii) **Aboriginal Self-Government**

Constitution Act, 1867, s. 91(24) 419

Constitution Act, 1982, s. 25 and 35 420

Constitutional Proposals, 1991 421

Federal Publication, "Aboriginal Peoples, Self-Government, and Constitutional Reform", Oct. 1992 423

Bradford Morse, "Inherent/justiciable/contingent /new: Defining the right to self government", (1991) 1 The Network 6 434

Gail Stacey-Moore, "Aboriginal Women, Self-Government, The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, and the 1991 Canada Package on the Constitution, Address to the Chiefs in Assembly, Nov 27, 1991 435

Tony Hall, "Native self-government: Comments on the federal proposals", (1991) The Network 7 . 442

Newspaper clippings 443

iii) **Social Charter**

Constitution Act, 1982, s. 36 460

Jack Donnelly, "The Interdependence and Indivisibility of Human Rights", from Universal Human Rights in Theory and Practice, pp. 28-45 461

Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, Queen's University, "Approaches to National Standards in Federal Systems, prepared for the Ontario Government, September 1991, pp. 28-74 466

Ministry of Intergovernmental Affairs, Ontario, "A Canadian Social Charter: Making Our Shared Values Stronger", September 1991 490

Will Kymlica and Wayne J. Norman, "The Social Charter Debate: Should social justice be constitutionalized?" article for network . . . 497

Ontario's Proposal for A Social Charter for Canada, released Feb. 13th, 1992 511